

Article Search ▾

English · Deutsch · Español · Français · Italiano · 日本語 · Português

My Account

Home > Games > Magic > Magicthegathering.com > Columns



MAGICTHEGATHERING.COM

ARTICLES

▾ Related links

➔ Read other articles

TOURNAMENTS

MAGIC ONLINE

Article Search ▾

CR and UNH Sign Historic Agreement



John Carter · Saturday School
Saturday, November 13, 2004

Send your rules questions to **Magic** Rules Manager [John Carter](#). Can't find the answer to your question somewhere else, like the [Magic Comprehensive Rules](#)? Maybe he's already answered it! Try the [Saturday School Searchable Rules Database](#).

Next Saturday is [Unhinged Release Events Day](#)! I would launch into cool stories about the utter brokenness of *Unhinged*, but this is a rules column, and frankly, *Unhinged* makes me lose sleep. You see, as R&D's resident rules developer, I'm the last line of defense between sanity and Mark Rosewater, and that line runs pretty thin in silver-bordered land. So let me just say this now: the Comprehensive Rules and *Unhinged* have signed a ceasefire. If you think you're in no man's land somewhere between **Magic** and reality, it's probably because you are. Bring a helmet.

That being said, let's hit some real cards while we can...

Q: If I splice *Soulless Revival* onto *Devouring Greed*, will I be able to return one of the sacrificed creatures to my hand? --Richard

A: No, you'll have to target the creature card in your graveyard for the splice before you begin paying costs for the Greed [CR 409.1c, 409.1h]

Q: My opponent has five spirits in play and wants to play *Devouring Greed* and sacrifice them all because I am at 12 life. Can I respond to the announcement of the spell and bounce one spirit to his hand in order not to lose? --Nikos P.

A: No: the sacrifice is an "additional cost" to play the spell, which means he sacrificed them as part of the announcement. By the time you can respond, the spirits are already gone.

***Extra*:** On the plus side, if you can counter the spell somehow, he will have sacrificed all those creatures for no effect.

Q: What if use *Kiki-Jiki*, *Mirror Breaker* on some random creature. Then I play *Parallel Evolution*, which will make a copy of the token that is copy of my creature. Will I have to sacrifice the copy of the token at the end of my turn? --Andrew M.

A: No, the sacrifice only applies to the token made by Kiki-Jiki.

Q: Say I have two different creatures in play that both have the trigger "whenever you play a Spirit or Arcane spell... If I play an arcane spell and trigger both effects I can chose the order in which they resolve? --Mickey K.

A: Yes, you stack them in order with the first one you want to resolve stacked last [CR 410.3].

Q: If I have **Yosei, the Morning Star** and **Horobi, Death's Wail** in play. If I put Yosei in the graveyard, does it destroy enemy creatures I target? --Arthur P.

A: Yes, Yosei's triggered ability will let you tap up to five target permanents. If those permanents are creatures, Horobi will trigger and destroy them.

Q: Does **Horobi, Death's Wail** still trigger if my opponent counters the spell that targets one of his creatures? --Jeremy

A: Yes, the creatures were targeted while the spell was announced [CR 409.1c]. Countering the spell or killing Horobi after the spell's announcement doesn't stop the triggers that would be placed on the stack right after the announcement [CR 402.6].
(In fact, when Horobi is in play, almost all spells that target creatures get countered. Horobi usually kills the creature before the spell resolves, and the rules will automatically counter a spell that has no remaining targets.)

Q: Say I have a **Nighteyes the Desecrator** (the flip of **Nezumi Graverobber**) in play and then I play **Horobi, Death's Wail**. My friend says that when I use Nighteyes' ability the creature gets destroyed again because of Horobi. Please help. --Dave

A: Your friend is incorrect. Nighteyes targets creature cards in graveyards (dead creatures), and Horobi's ability only affects creatures — live ones in play that Horobi makes dead. Since the desecrating only targets a creature card, the corpse will come back and become a creature.

Q: If my opponent has a flipped hero card **Dokai, Weaver of Life**, and then I play a nonflipped **Budoka Gardener**, will they both put into graveyard or not since mine is not a legend yet? --Andik

A: None of them would be put into the graveyard yet. If you can flip yours into Dokai, then they'd both die because they're both Legendary.



Q: I have **Kumano, Master Yamabushi**, **Tok-Tok, Volcano Born** (a flipped **Akki Lavarunner**), and **Furnace of Rath**. I activate the Yamabushi's ability and target an opponent with 1 damage. Would the Furnace double it then Tok-Tok adds 1 for a total of 3, or does Tok-Tok add his 1, then it's doubled for a total of 4?

A: It's up to the opponent. The player who is getting hit, or the controller of the permanent getting hit is the one who decides the order of replacement abilities (Furnace and Tok-Tok are both replacement effects) [CR 419.9a].

Q: Say you have a flipped **Akki Lavarunner** (aka **Tok-Tok, Volcano Born**) in play and you play a **Lava Spike** and splice a **Glacial Ray** on to it also targeting the player. Now Tok-Tok says that a spell deals one extra damage, we were wondering which part of the spell would deal the extra damage: the original text three damage or the spliced text that **Glacial Ray** added? --Scott S.

A: Both, the source is dealing damage twice. The text of the spell is now: "[this spell] deals three damage to target player. [this spell] deals two damage to target creature or player." Since Tok-Tok looks for every time a source deals damage, it will apply for the original dealing and for the splice dealing.

Q: I have **Night of Soul's Betrayal** and **Forbidden Orchard** in play. If I used **Forbidden Orchard** for mana does my opponent get the 1/1 creature token? --Eric A.

A: Yes, but not for long. When the Orchard's triggered ability resolves you'll put a 1/1 token into play under your opponent's control, but the Betrayal will make it a 0/0, and state-based effects

will put it in the graveyard before anyone can play anything.

Extra Because the Orchard's token is created by a trigger, your opponent could respond to the trigger. If he or she gets rid of the Betrayal before the trigger resolves, the token will survive.

Q: I had a **Shizo, Death's Storehouse** out and one in my hand. I first tapped the one in play for a black mana then played the other Shizo as my land for the turn and tapped that for a black mana. My opponent tells me that mana is faster than anything in **Magic**, but is it faster than the Legend rule? --Ryan

A: The Legend(ary) rule [CR 420.5e] trumps both of you. It's true that mana abilities resolve on announcement, but in order to announce the ability, you have to have priority. You don't get priority after playing a land until after state-based effects (like the Legend rule) check [CR Glossary: Priority].

Q: I've got a question about **Sensei's Divining Top**. Can I use the ability of the Top to draw a card even when there are no more cards in my library? --Karsten

A: Sure, you can use the ability. Unfortunately you'll lose the game because no card was there when you tried to draw [CR 420.5g].

Q: If I use **Uyo** to copy a spell played by my opponent without a target, such as **Counsel of the Soratami**, who draws the two cards from the copy? What if I played the **Counsel of the Soratami** and copied it using **Uyo**? --Matt Marino

A: You draw the cards either way. As the player who made the copy, you are the controller of the copy, so you follow the copy's instructions [CR Glossary: Controller].

Q: If I block a 2/2 creature with a **Kabuto Moth**, then tap the moth to give itself +1/+2, does the attacking creature die or does the moth deal no damage because it was removed from combat because it got tapped?

A: The attacking creature dies. Tapping or untapping a creature doesn't do anything to whether or not it's attacking.

***Extra*:** Way back before *6th Edition* came out, tapped blockers dealt no combat damage (they were still in combat though), but it was decided (rightly) that the rule was confusing and unnecessary. That change was in April of 1999.

Q: I play **Cranial Extraction**. In response my opponent plays **Mana Leak**. I pay the 3 mana, and my opponent **Mana Leaks** again, saying that the stack has only resolved up to the **Mana Leak**. Is he correct? -- Adam

A: Yes, he is. When spells and/or abilities are on the stack and both players pass in succession, only the top spell or ability resolves. Once it has finished resolving both players will receive priority again before the next spell or ability resolves [CR 408.1c].

***Extra*:** Prior to *6th Edition* (April 1999), spells resolved in "batches". Once a flurry of spells was cast they would all resolve one after the other without pausing. Nowadays we resolve spells and abilities one at a time and give you the opportunity to capitalize anywhere in the process.

Q: If I have **Tangle Asp** in play with a **Regeneration** enchanting it, can I equip **Nemesis Mask** to it causing all my opponents creatures to die and regenerate **Tangle Asp**? --Sam

A: Yes. The Asp destroys the blockers regardless of where you would assign his one point. Some cards like **Lowland Basilisk** are different in that they require damage to destroy things, but



not **Tangle Asp**.

Q: I'm curious about how priority works. For instance, in MTGO I have played solitaire games against myself in which I am not able to counter my own spells. I suppose my question is in regards to whether or not a player can respond to their own spell or ability on the stack with **Uyo**, for example. --Matthew

A: Yes, you can respond to your own spells and abilities. As a matter of fact, you automatically get priority whenever you play a spell or ability regardless of whose turn it is [CR 408.1c]. Once you're done playing spells or abilities, you pass priority to your opponent. If you only play one spell and pass, and the opponent passes, then the spell will resolve. In the case of **Magic Online** (MTGO), you can hold down the Ctrl key while playing a spell or ability to let the server know you want to respond.

Q: Why would **Serra Angel** be errataed to have "Vigilance", yet at the same time **Chub Toad** would not be errataed to have "Bushido: 2". Is there some guideline that is followed by R&D or Rules Management that determines when a card is updated? As a rule of thumb, are two abilities whose text or reminder text is worded the same way considered by the game to be identical, or not? Or is this determined on a card-by-card basis? --Chub Angel Samurai

A: **Chub Toad** is a Toad, not a Samurai. Overall, if a creature has an ability like Fear or Vigilance, we'll update the wordings with errata as appropriate. Pre-**Kamigawa** cards didn't get errata for Bushido because Bushido only appears on Samurai. This is a design choice with Bushido in particular, not a reflection on errata in general.

Q: How did the targeting rules have to change in order to allow a spliced spell and the spell onto which it was spliced to have different targets? --Mark C.

A: The rules didn't change to allow *different* targets: they changed to allow splices to target the *same* target as each other. The targeting rule in [CR 409.1c] was adjusted. Rather than state that a spell cannot target anything more than once, the rule was adjusted so that a spell can target something once for each instance of the word "target" on the spell. Since splice copies on text, it will be adding extra occurrences of "target" onto the text.

Q: If I have an **Island Sanctuary**, and a **Howling Mine** in play, during my draw step, I skip drawing a card (the one for my turn) and then draw for the **Howling Mine**, right? --Mike B.

A: That works fine. Since **Island Sanctuary** has you skip drawing a card during your draw step, it doesn't actually matter which one you skip. You could even skip both if you wanted to.

Q: If my opponent plays **Blanket of Night** making all my Plains also Swamps and then I play **Celestial Dawn**, what happens? --Rodney

A: Your lands are Plains. In most cases, continuous effects are applied one after another in timestamp order, which is the order they come into play. First the **Blanket** makes each land "a Swamp in addition to its land type", and then **Celestial Dawn** says, "Lands you control are Plains" which removes all previous land types.

Q: If a spell or permanent becomes another color from an ability, does it retain its original color? For example, if I turn a **Disciple of the Vault** white via **Eight-and-a-Half-Tails'** ability, can I **Terror** it? --Vincenzo

A: No, it will not retain its previous color(s). You can **Terror** an **Eight-and-a-Half Tailsed** Disciple.



Q: I have a **Bösium Strip** on the table and the top card of my graveyard is a **Capsize**. I activate the Strip and play the **Capsize**, paying its buyback. Can I put the **Capsize** into my hand and keep it? It looks like the Strip and buyback are trying to replace the same event - going to my graveyard - so I can replace it with buyback and ignore **Bösium Strip**'s replacement. Is this right? --Jon A.

A: Yes, buyback will let you retrieve cards played off **Bösium Strip**.

Q: It is the end of my turn. I have a **Myr Servitor** in my graveyard. My opponent has 2 in play and 1 in his graveyard. Do I return my **Myr Servitor** to play, and do I do it at his next upkeep, or do I have to wait until my upkeep? --Derek B.

A: You don't have to wait. If a player has **Myr Servitor** in play, then its ability will trigger at the beginning of his or her upkeep. When the ability resolves, it states that *each* player returns all Servitors to play.

Q: How are **Trinisphere** and splicing meant to interact with one another? If I play **Lava Spike** with **Glacial Ray** spliced onto it, will **Trinisphere** overlook that, or do I need to pay 2 for **Lava Spike** itself? --Joel S.

A: **Lava Spike** with **Glacial Ray** spliced on is fine for **Trinisphere** without costing extra. **Trinisphere** waits until the total cost to play a spell is calculated (mana cost + additions – reductions) and then adjusts the cost if the total is less than three. If you spliced **Blessed Breath** instead of **Glacial Ray**, the **Trinisphere** would see that + * = 2 and would increase it to 1*.*.

Q: Can you **Orim's Chant** in response to your opponent playing **Dark Ritual** or any of the other mana producing one shot spells to cause them to mana burn, assuming they have no ways to get rid of the mana? --Steve

A: Yes, you can. One of the *6th Edition* changes was removing "mana source" as a card type. This means **Dark Ritual** and **Seething Song** use the stack, and it means you can't play them while announcing a spell or ability.



Q: How does **Cheatyface** work? --Andy H.

A: Let's use an example: if my editor doesn't notice, then this question gets posted. If the page goes up as is, then it's out there, and he can't do much about it. Then again, that's assuming he doesn't want you to see it, and given what we've said in other columns this week we know that's not true. Plus, you clearly *are* reading this. Where does that leave you? That's not really a rules question, so I'm afraid I can't help you.

Q: What exactly does **Bureaucracy** do? (Oracle, please.) --Arthur

A: Here you go, fresh off [Gatherer](#):

Pursuant to subsection 3.1(4) of Richard's Rules of Order, during the upkeep of each participant in this game of the Magic: The Gathering® trading card game (hereafter known as "PLAYER"), that PLAYER performs all actions in the sequence of previously added actions (hereafter known as "ACTION QUEUE"), in the order those actions were added, then adds another action to the end of the ACTION QUEUE. All actions must be simple physical or verbal actions that a player can perform while sitting in a chair, without jeopardizing the health and security of said PLAYER. If any PLAYER does not perform all the prescribed actions in the correct order, sacrifice Bureaucracy and said PLAYER

discards his or her complement of cards in hand (hereafter known as "HAND").

Seems pretty clear. Right?

If I were in a hurry, I might say,

At the beginning of each player's upkeep, that player does a physical or verbal action after doing all previous actions done in this way. If that player does not, sacrifice Bureaucracy, and that player discards his or her hand.

But that just kills the joke, doesn't it?

Thanks to everyone who provided feedback on States for last week. Here are the results:

If you went to the event, how did you find out about your State (Province, Island, Territory) Champs?		
Friends	408	23.3%
Magicthegathering.com's front page	367	20.9%
Local store	324	18.5%
Magicthegathering.com's tournament center	286	16.3%
Tournament organizer who runs PTQs, etc.	235	13.4%
Saturday School very late that Friday	81	4.6%
At the prerelease	53	3.0%
Total	1754	100.0%

That's all for this week from Down Under. Next week: GP Brisbane and trips into silver-bordered land. Good luck next week at the release events. Enjoy your whuppin's.

Class dismissed.

--Carter



[Discuss](#) on the message boards



[Respond](#) via email



[John Carter](#) archive

[WHAT'S NEW](#) [CORPORATE INFO](#) [WHERE TO BUY](#) [INTERNATIONAL](#) [SUPPORT](#) [SITEMAP](#) [PRODUCTS](#)

© 1995-2005 Wizards of the Coast, Inc., a subsidiary of Hasbro, Inc. All Rights Reserved.
Wizards is headquartered in Renton, Washington, PO Box 707, Renton, WA 98057.
[PRIVACY STATEMENT](#)